

# Financial Time Series

MSA 410 / TMS 088

Lösör: 2017-18, Lp 4

Exam: 1, June 1, 2018

Examiner: Annika Lang

(1)  $X_t = (1 + \mu) X_{t-1} + \sqrt{\delta + \beta X_{t-1}^2} z_t$

•  $z \sim IID N(0,1)$

Problem 1

16 points

Consider  $\mu = -1, \delta = 1, \beta = \frac{1}{2}$ , i.e.,

(1\*)  $X_t = \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2} z_t$

Set

$\beta_t^2 := 1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2$

then

$X_t = \beta_t z_t$

} (2)

91 a) Claim:  $X$  is an ARCH(1)-process.

Proof:

We have to show:

(i)  $X$  stationary (1/2)

(ii)  $X$  has the representation (1/2)

$X_t = \beta_t z_t$

$\beta_t^2 = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 X_{t-1}^2, \alpha_0 > 0, \alpha_1 \geq 0$

$$(iii) \quad z_t \perp\!\!\!\perp (X_{t-j}, j \in \mathbb{N}) - \textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$z_t \sim \text{IDW}(0,1)$$

(iii) is satisfied by assumption.

To see (ii), set

$$\alpha_0 := \delta = 1 > 0, \quad \textcircled{\frac{1}{2}} \textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\alpha_1 := \sigma = \frac{1}{2} \geq 0,$$

then (2) is the desired representation.

To show (i), we need to show

(a)  $\mathbb{E}[X_t]$  is constant  $\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$

(b)  $\text{Var}[X_t] < +\infty$   $-\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$

(c)  $\text{Cov}[X_{t+h}, X_{s+h}] = \text{Cov}[X_t, X_s] \quad \forall s, t, h \in \mathbb{Z}$   $\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$

$$(a) \quad \mathbb{E}[X_t] = \mathbb{E}\left[\sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2} z_t\right]$$

$$\stackrel{z_t \perp\!\!\!\perp X_{t-1}}{=} \mathbb{E}\left[\sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2}\right] \mathbb{E}[z_t] \quad \textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\stackrel{z_t \sim \text{W}(0,1)}{=} \mathbb{E}\left[\sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2}\right] \cdot 0$$

$$\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}} = 0 \quad \text{if } \text{Var}[X_t] = \mathbb{E}[X_t^2] < +\infty, \text{ see (b) by Hölder}$$

(b)  $\text{Var}[X_t] \stackrel{\text{IE}}{=} 2 < +\infty$  By assumption

(c)  $\text{Cov}[X_{t+h}, X_{t+h}] = \text{Var}[X_{t+h}] = 2$   $\textcircled{1}$

$$= \text{Var}[X_t] = \text{Cov}[X_t, X_t]$$

Let now  $s \neq t$ ,  $t > s$  ( $t < s$  follows by symmetry)  $\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}}$

$$\text{Cov}[X_s, X_t] \stackrel{\text{IE}=0}{=} \mathbb{E}[X_s X_t]$$

$$\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}} = \mathbb{E}\left[X_s \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2} z_t\right]$$

$$\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}} \stackrel{z_t \perp\!\!\!\perp X_s}{=} \mathbb{E}\left[X_s \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2}\right] \mathbb{E}[z_t]$$

$$\stackrel{z_t \sim \text{W}(0,1)}{=} \mathbb{E}\left[X_s \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2}\right] \cdot 0$$

$$\textcircled{\frac{1}{2}} = 0 \quad \text{since } \text{Var}[X_s] = 2 < +\infty$$

$$\mathbb{E}\left[X_s \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2}\right] \stackrel{\text{Hölder}}{\leq} \mathbb{E}[X_s^2]^{\frac{1}{2}} \mathbb{E}\left[1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right]^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$= \sqrt{2} \cdot \sqrt{1+1} = 2 \quad \text{||}$$

Therefore we conclude that  $X$  is an ARCH(1)-process.

[3] b) Claim:  $X$  is WN(0, 2).

Proof: We have to show that

- $E[X_t] = 0$  (1/2)
- $\gamma_X(h) = \begin{cases} 2 & \text{if } h=0 \\ 0 & \text{else} \end{cases}$  (1/2)

From a)(i)(a) we know that  $E[X_t] = 0$  (1/2)

It follows from the definition of the ACVF that

$$\gamma_X(h) = \text{Cov}[X_t, X_{t+h}]$$
(1/2)

for arbitrary  $t$ , since  $X$  is stationary (1/2)

From a)(i)(c) we obtain

$$\gamma_X(h) = \text{Cov}[X_t, X_{t+h}] = \begin{cases} 2 & \text{if } h=0 \\ 0 & \text{else,} \end{cases}$$
(1/2)

which finishes the proof.

[4] c) We show in Problem 2(c) that  $E[X_s^2 X_t^2] - E[X_s^2] E[X_t^2]$

$$\textcircled{1} \quad \text{Cov}(X_s^2, X_t^2) = E[(X_s^2 - E[X_s^2])(X_t^2 - E[X_t^2])] = 2^{5-|t-s|} \quad \text{for } s \neq t$$

If  $X$  would be IID, then for all measurable  $f, g$ :

$$\textcircled{1/2} \quad E[f(X_s)g(X_t)] = E[f(X_s)]E[g(X_t)] \quad \text{for } s \neq t.$$

$$\textcircled{1/2} \quad \text{Set } f(x) := g(x) := x^2$$

$$\textcircled{1/2} \quad \Rightarrow E[X_s^2 X_t^2] = E[X_s^2] E[X_t^2]$$

$$\textcircled{1/2} \quad \Rightarrow \text{Cov}[X_s^2, X_t^2] = 0,$$

(1/2) which is a contradiction to Prob. 2(c)

$$\textcircled{1/2} \quad \Rightarrow X \text{ is not IID.}$$

Problem 2

44 points

IIa)  $E[X_t^2] = \text{Var}[X_t] = 2$  (1)

IIb)  $E[X_t^4] = E\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right) z_t^2\right]^2$

$= E\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right)^2 z_t^4\right]$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{z_t \perp X_{t-1}}{=} E\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right)^2\right] E[z_t^4]$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{z_t \sim N(0,1)}{=} E\left[1 + X_{t-1}^2 + \frac{1}{4} X_{t-1}^4\right] \cdot 3$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{E[z_t^4]}{=} 3 + 3E[X_{t-1}^2] + \frac{3}{4} E[X_{t-1}^4]$

$\stackrel{a)}{=} 3 + 6 + \frac{3}{4} E[X_{t-1}^4]$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{E[X_{t-1}^4] \text{ const}}{=} 9 + \frac{3}{4} E[X_t^4]$  (1/2)

$\Leftrightarrow \left(1 - \frac{3}{4}\right) E[X_t^4] = 9$  (1/2)

$\Leftrightarrow E[X_t^4] = 9 \cdot 4 = 36$  (1/2)

IIc) Let  $t$  be fixed and  $h > 0$

$\text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_{t+h}^2] = E[X_t^2 X_{t+h}^2] - E[X_t^2] E[X_{t+h}^2]$

$\stackrel{a)}{=} E[X_t^2 X_{t+h}^2] - 4$  (1/2)

$= E\left[X_t^2 \left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t+h-1}^2\right) z_{t+h}^2\right] - 4$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{z_t \perp X_{t+h-1}}{=} E\left[X_t^2 + \frac{1}{2} X_t^2 X_{t+h-1}^2\right] E[z_{t+h}^2] - 4$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{z_t \sim N(0,1)}{=} (2 + \frac{1}{2} E[X_t^2 X_{t+h-1}^2]) \cdot 1 - 4$  (1/2)

$= 2 + \frac{1}{2} (\text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_{t+h-1}^2] + 4) - 4$  (1/2)

$= \frac{1}{2} \text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_{t+h-1}^2]$  (1/2)

$\stackrel{rec \dots}{=} \dots 2^{-h} \text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_t^2]$  (1)

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= 2^{-h} \cdot (\mathbb{E}[X_t^4] - \mathbb{E}[X_t^2]^2) \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right) \\
 &\stackrel{\text{b.a.}}{=} 2^{-h} (36 - 4) \\
 &= 2^{-h} \cdot 2^5 \\
 &= \underline{2^{5-h}} \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)
 \end{aligned}$$

Let now  $h < 0$ , then

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_{t+h}^2] &= \text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_{t-(-h)}^2] \\
 \text{Set } \tilde{t} &= t - (-h) \\
 &= \text{Cov}[X_{\tilde{t}+(-h)}^2, X_{\tilde{t}}^2] \quad (1) \\
 &\stackrel{\text{sym. cov.}}{=} \text{Cov}[X_{\tilde{t}}^2, X_{\tilde{t}+(-h)}^2] \\
 &\stackrel{-h > 0}{=} 2^{5-(-h)}
 \end{aligned}$$

For  $h = 0$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_t^2] &= \text{Var}[X_t^2] \\
 &= \mathbb{E}[X_t^4] - \mathbb{E}[X_t^2]^2 \quad (1) \\
 &\stackrel{\text{b.a.}}{=} 32 = 2^5
 \end{aligned}$$

$\Rightarrow$  We conclude

$$\boxed{\text{Cov}[X_t, X_{t+h}] = 2^{5-|h|}}, \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

which does not depend on  $t$ .

5.5 e) Set  $\tilde{z}_t = X_t^2 - b_t^2$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= X_t^2 - \left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right)
 \end{aligned}$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{E}[\tilde{z}_t] &= \mathbb{E}[X_t^2 - b_t^2] \\
 &\stackrel{\text{lin.}}{=} \mathbb{E}[X_t^2] - 1 - \frac{1}{2} \mathbb{E}[X_{t-1}^2] \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right) \\
 &\stackrel{\text{a.}}{=} 2 - 1 - \frac{1}{2} \cdot 2 \\
 &= 0 \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Cov}[\tilde{z}_s, \tilde{z}_t] \stackrel{E=0}{=} \mathbb{E}[\tilde{z}_s \tilde{z}_t] \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$= \mathbb{E}\left[\left(X_s^2 - 1 - \frac{1}{2} X_{s-1}^2\right)\left(X_t^2 - 1 - \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right)\right] \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$= \mathbb{E}\left[X_s^2 X_t^2 - X_s^2 - \frac{1}{2} X_s^2 X_{t-1}^2\right]$$

$$- \mathbb{E}\left[X_t^2 - 1 - \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2\right]$$

$$+ \frac{1}{2} \mathbb{E}\left[X_{s-1}^2 X_t^2 - X_{s-1}^2 - \frac{1}{2} X_{s-1}^2 X_{t-1}^2\right] \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$\mathbb{E}[\tilde{z}_t] = 0$$

$$= \text{Cov}[X_s^2, X_t^2] + 4 - 2 - \frac{1}{2} \text{Cov}[X_s^2, X_{t-1}^2] - \frac{1}{2} 4$$

$$= 0$$

$$- \frac{1}{2} \left( \text{Cov}[X_{s-1}^2, X_t^2] + 4 - 2 - \frac{1}{2} \text{Cov}[X_{s-1}^2, X_{t-1}^2] - 2 \right)$$

$$\stackrel{c)}{=} \left(1 + \frac{1}{4}\right) 2^{5-|t-s|} - \frac{1}{2} 2^{5-|t-s-1|} - \frac{1}{2} 2^{5-|t-1-s|} \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$= 5 \cdot 2^{5-2-|t-s|} - 2^{4-|t-s-1|} - 2^{4-|t-1-s|} \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$= \begin{cases} 5 \cdot 2^3 - 2^3 - 2^3 = 24 & t=s \\ 2^{3-|t-s|} (5 - 2^{1+|t-s|} - 2^{1-|t-s|}) = 0 & t>s \\ 2^{3-|t-s|} (5 - 2^{1-|t-s|} - 2^{1+|t-s|}) = 0 & t<s \end{cases} \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$\Rightarrow \tilde{z} \text{ is WN}(0, 24) \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$\frac{1}{d)} \text{ From a) } \mathbb{E}[X_t^2] = 2 \text{ is constant} \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$\text{From b) } \text{Var}[X_t^2] = \mathbb{E}[X_t^4] - \mathbb{E}[X_t^2]^2$$

$$= 36 - 4$$

$$= 32 < +\infty \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

$$\text{From c) } \text{Cov}[X_t^2, X_s^2] = 2^{5-|t-s|}$$

$$= 2^{5-|t+s-(s+t)|}$$

$$= \text{Cov}[X_{t+h}, X_{s+h}] \quad \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)$$

Therefore all conditions for a stationary TS are satisfied.

4) f) We have to show that we find a representation.

$$(\tilde{X}_t - \mathbb{E}[\tilde{X}_t]) - \phi_1 (\tilde{X}_{t-1} - \mathbb{E}[\tilde{X}_{t-1}]) = \tilde{z}_t, \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$\tilde{z} \sim WN(0, \sigma^2)$ , since we have already shown that  $X^2$  is stationary.  $(\frac{1}{2})$

We have:

$$\begin{aligned} \sigma_t^2 &= X_t^2 - \tilde{z}_t \\ &= 1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2 \quad \text{by construction} \quad (\frac{1}{2}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow X_t^2 - \tilde{z}_t = 1 + \frac{1}{2} X_{t-1}^2 = 2 + \frac{1}{2} (X_{t-1}^2 - 2) \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$$\Leftrightarrow (X_t^2 - 2) - \frac{1}{2} (X_{t-1}^2 - 2) = \tilde{z}_t, \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

where  $\tilde{z} \sim WN(0, 2/4)$  by c).  $(\frac{1}{2})$

Set  $\phi_1 := \frac{1}{2}$  and we are done.  $(\frac{1}{2})$

55) g) Given  $X_1^2$  and  $X_2^2$ , we derive the best linear predictor  $b_3^e(X_1^2, X_2^2)$  for  $X_3^2$  from Proposition 2.3.5.

$$b_3^e(X_1^2, X_2^2) = a_0 + a_1 X_1^2 + a_2 X_2^2 \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$$a_0 = \mathbb{E}[X_3^2] (1 - a_1 - a_2) = 2(1 - a_1 - a_2) \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$$\begin{pmatrix} \gamma(0) & \gamma(1) \\ \gamma(1) & \gamma(0) \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} a_1 \\ a_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \gamma(1) \\ \gamma(2) \end{pmatrix} \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$$\Leftrightarrow 2^5 \cdot \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \frac{1}{2} \\ \frac{1}{2} & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} a_1 \\ a_2 \end{pmatrix} = 2^5 \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{2} \\ \frac{1}{4} \end{pmatrix} \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$$\Leftrightarrow \begin{pmatrix} a_1 + \frac{1}{2} a_2 = \frac{1}{2} \\ \frac{1}{2} a_1 + a_2 = \frac{1}{4} \end{pmatrix} \quad (\frac{1}{2})$$

$$\Rightarrow \left(\frac{1}{2} - 2\right) a_2 = \frac{1}{2} - 2 \cdot \frac{1}{4} = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow -\frac{3}{2} a_2 = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \boxed{a_2 = 0}$$

$$\Rightarrow a_1 + \frac{1}{2} \cdot 0 = \frac{1}{2}$$

$$\Rightarrow \boxed{a_1 = \frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\Rightarrow \boxed{b_3^e((X_1^2, X_2^2)) = 1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2}$$

since

$$\boxed{a_0 = 2\left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\right) = 1}$$

$$\frac{21}{h) \text{ MSE}[b_3^e((X_1^2, X_2^2)), X_3^2] \stackrel{\textcircled{1/2}}{=} E[(b_3^e((X_1^2, X_2^2)) - X_3^2)^2]$$

$$\stackrel{\textcircled{1/2}}{=} E\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2 - \left(2 + \frac{1}{2}(X_2^2 - 2)\right) + \tilde{z}_3\right)^2\right]$$

$$\stackrel{\textcircled{1/2}}{=} E[\tilde{z}_3^2]$$

$$\stackrel{\textcircled{1/2}}{=} 24$$

5) i) Let  $X_1, X_2$  be given.

Compute

$$X_3^{(1)} = \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^{2(1)}} z_3^{(1)}$$

$$X_3^{(2)} = \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^{2(2)}} z_3^{(2)}$$

(\*) Set

$$X_2^{(1)} := \frac{1}{2} \sqrt{1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^{2(1)}} (z_3^{(1)} + z_3^{(2)}) \quad \textcircled{1}$$

and

$$(X_2^{(1)})^2 = \frac{1}{4} \left(1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^{2(1)}\right) (z_3^{(1)} + z_3^{(2)})^2 \quad \textcircled{1}$$

or



(\*\*)

$$X_2^2(1) = \frac{1}{2} (X_3^{(1)2} + X_3^{(2)2}) \quad (1)$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2) (Z_3^{(1)2} + Z_3^{(2)2}) \quad (1)$$

SS(j)  $MSE [X_2^2(1), X_3^2] \stackrel{(1/2)}{=} E [ (\frac{1}{4} (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2) (Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)})^2 - (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2) Z_3^2 )^2 ]$

$$\stackrel{(1/2)}{=} E [ (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2)^2 ( \frac{1}{4} (Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)})^2 - Z_3^2 )^2 ]$$

$$\stackrel{(1/2)}{=} E [ (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2)^2 ] E [ Z_3^4 (Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)})^4 - \frac{1}{2} (Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)})^2 Z_3^2 + Z_3^4 ]$$

$Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)} \sim N(0, 2)$   
 $36^4$

$$\stackrel{(*)}{=} 12 \cdot (2^{-4} \cdot 12 - \frac{1}{2} E [ (Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)})^2 ] E [ Z_3^2 ] + 3)$$

$$\stackrel{(1/2)}{=} 12 \cdot ( \frac{3}{4} - \frac{1}{2} \cdot 2 \cdot 1 + 3 )$$

$$= 3 \cdot 12 \cdot \frac{11}{4} = 33 \quad (1/2)$$

$$MSE [ X_2^2(1), X_3^2 ] \stackrel{(1/2)}{=} E [ ( \frac{1}{2} (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2) (Z_3^{(1)2} + Z_3^{(2)2}) - (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2) Z_3^2 )^2 ]$$

$$\stackrel{(1/2)}{=} E [ (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2)^2 ] E [ \frac{1}{4} (Z_3^{(1)2} + Z_3^{(2)2} - 2 Z_3^2)^2 ]$$

$$\stackrel{(*)}{=} 12 \cdot ( \frac{1}{4} E [ (Z_3^{(1)2} + Z_3^{(2)2})^2 - 4 (Z_3^{(1)2} + Z_3^{(2)2}) Z_3^2 + 4 Z_3^4 ] )$$

proposed  
 random  
 distribution

$$= 12 \cdot ( \frac{1}{4} E [ Z_3^{(1)4} + 2 Z_3^{(1)2} Z_3^{(2)2} + Z_3^{(2)4} ]$$

$$- (1 \cdot 1 + 1 \cdot 1) + 3 )$$

$$= 12 \cdot ( 2 + 1 )$$

$$\stackrel{(1/2)}{=} 36$$

$$(*) E [ (1 + \frac{1}{2} X_2^2)^2 ] = 1 + E [ X_2^2 ] + \frac{1}{4} E [ X_2^4 ]$$

$$\stackrel{Prob 2b}{=} 1 + 2 + \frac{1}{4} \cdot 36 = 12 \quad (1)$$

3) The mean squared errors for the three are

$$b_3^e((X_1^2, X_2^2)) : 24$$

$$X_2(1)^2 : 33 \quad \text{eg. } \textcircled{1}$$

$$X_3^2(1) : 36$$

The best linear predictor has the smallest MSE

$X_2(1)^2$  performs better than  $X_3^2(1)$ . eg.  $\textcircled{1}$

This means that it is better to estimate  $X_2(1)$ , the predictor of  $X_3$  and then square it instead of computing the sample mean of the squared predictor samples. eg.  $\textcircled{1}$

At the same time it holds that

$$\begin{aligned} \bullet \mathbb{E}[X_3^2] &= \mathbb{E}\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)Z_3^2\right] \stackrel{\text{II}}{=} \mathbb{E}\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)\right] \mathbb{E}[Z_3^2] \\ &= \mathbb{E}\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)\right] \\ &= \mathbb{E}\left[b_3^e((X_1^2, X_2^2))\right] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \bullet \mathbb{E}[X_3^2(1)] &= \mathbb{E}\left[\frac{1}{2}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)(Z_3^{(1)2} + Z_3^{(2)2})\right] \\ &\stackrel{\text{II}}{=} \frac{1}{2} \mathbb{E}\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)\right] \cdot \left(\mathbb{E}[Z_3^{(1)2}] + \mathbb{E}[Z_3^{(2)2}]\right) \\ &= \mathbb{E}[X_3^2] \end{aligned}$$

BUT

$$\begin{aligned} \bullet \mathbb{E}[X_2(1)^2] &= \mathbb{E}\left[\frac{1}{4}\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)(Z_3^{(1)} + Z_3^{(2)})^2\right] \\ &\stackrel{\text{II}}{=} \frac{1}{4} \mathbb{E}\left[\left(1 + \frac{1}{2}X_2^2\right)\right] \mathbb{E}\left[Z_3^{(1)2} + 2Z_3^{(1)}Z_3^{(2)} + Z_3^{(2)2}\right] \\ &\stackrel{\text{III}}{=} \frac{1}{4} \mathbb{E}[X_3^2] \cdot \left(1 + 2 \underbrace{\mathbb{E}[Z_3^{(1)}]}_0 \underbrace{\mathbb{E}[Z_3^{(2)}]}_0 + 1\right) \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \mathbb{E}[X_3^2], \end{aligned}$$

i.e.,  $(X_2(1))^2$  is biased.

So  $X_2(1)^2$  has a smaller MSE but at the same time underestimates on average. The experimenter must decide what to prefer.